

## MINUTES OF MEETING

### INDIAN HILL PLANNING COMMISSION

February 15, 2017

The Indian Hill Planning Commission meeting was held on Wednesday, February 15, 2017 at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers of the Village Administration building.

Members Present: Paul F. Madden  
Richard C. Wiggers  
Rita M. Stolper

Members Absent: Abbot A. Thayer  
Joseph W. Rhodenbaugh

Officials Present: Jonathan D. West, Assistant City Manager

Visitors Present: Thomas Rink, 9375 Whitegate Lane  
Graham Parlin, 5400 Brillwood Lane  
John Lanier, 8705 Indian Hill Road  
Jim Watson, McGill Smith Punshon, Inc.  
Mike Haehnle, Camargo Club  
Chip Pettengill, 8400 Summerhouse Road  
Chris Woodside, Cincinnati Country Day School

Chairman Madden calls the meeting to order and asks for those in attendance to please stand, raise their right hand, and be sworn in prior to presentation of the cases.

**Item Number 1:** Minutes and Findings of Fact for the January 17, 2017 meeting: Chairman Madden asks for comments or corrections to the January 17, 2017 Planning Commission minutes and Findings of Fact. There being none, Mr. Wiggers made a motion to approve the minutes and Findings of Fact. Mrs. Stolper seconded, and the motion was approved by those in attendance.

**Item Number 2:** Case #17-002: The Camargo Club is requesting special exception approval for the renovation of the golf practice range facility, relocation of the short game range, and the construction of a new golf instruction building. They will also be requesting a variance for the installation of a 5' to 8' high serpentine landscape berm designed to screen the practice facility from Shawnee Run Road. The Camargo Club operates under the continuing jurisdiction of the Planning Commission as an approved special exception. The property is located at 8605 Shawnee Run Road.

Mr. Graham Parlin, who is a member of the Camargo Club Planning Committee, comes before the Commission and states that he is in agreement with the Staff report that Mr. West prepared.

Mr. Parlin notes that over the past several years there has been more of a trend toward people utilizing their time more for practice than actually playing a round of golf. The

Camargo Club's practice facility was built in the 1930's and lacks the amount of space needed for today's demand.

The proposal also includes the construction of an indoor teaching facility that will match the architectural character of the existing pro-shop, renovation of the practice range facility, relocation of the short game range, and additional landscaping to ensure privacy.

**Staff Report:** Mr. West notes that the Camargo Club operates under the continuing jurisdiction of the Planning Commission as an approved special exception which requires authorization from the Planning Commission any time there is a request for new construction or renovations.

The practice range tee areas will be moved further north to accommodate the proposed mounding. A new cart path will be installed between the mounds and the tee, and the tee area will be elevated 2'. A new putting green will be installed between the practice tees and the golf instruction building. The practice range area will be extended further north toward the paddle tennis area to accommodate the relocated tee areas. The practice range area is proposed to have a large network of storm drains installed that will drain into a new detention basin. The Village is reviewing the storm water design to ensure it meets the Hamilton County Storm Water Regulations.

Although the plans show a 5' high serpentine landscape mound, the applicant is requesting the flexibility to go between 5'-8' to help screen the practice range tee area from Shawnee Run Road and provide more privacy for the golfers. The mound will be located between the existing large oak trees and the new cart path and tees. All existing landscaping along Shawnee Run Road will remain. Additional trees and shrubs will be planted on the mound to achieve the desired screening. The mound is only proposed to screen the practice range tee area, not the relocated short game range. The serpentine mounds require variance approval from the maximum height of 4'.

Staff received revised plans for the proposed golf instruction building, showing a 2800-2900 SF building with four bays for year round instruction and practice. The proposed building will sit 115' north of the Shawnee Run Road right-of-way line. The building is designed to fit in with the same architectural character and materials as the Camargo Club.

The existing short game practice range is located on the southeast corner of the range area. The short game range is proposed to be re-located to the west side of the existing asphalt drive that leads back to the maintenance building and paddle tennis area. It will be located between Shawnee Run Road and the existing maintenance building. The area will be approximately 90 yards long (parallel to Shawnee Run Road) with an elevated green in the center. A practice sand bunker will be located on the north side of the elevated green. Approximately 5+ trees will be removed to construct the short game practice range.

Mr. West notes that the twelve conditions for special exception approval and Staff's comments are contained in the Staff report; however, he highlights the following:

- **Standard (1) The establishment, maintenance or operation of the special exception will not be detrimental to or endanger the public health, safety, convenience, comfort, morals or general welfare;**

Granting the special exception will not be detrimental to public convenience, comfort, morals or general welfare. The driving range has been in use since the early to mid-1930's.

- **Standard (4) The special exception is consistent with the residential character of the immediate vicinity of the parcel proposed for development;**

There are no changes being made that will impact the residential character within the immediate vicinity. The only residences within the vicinity are to the east.

- **Standard (11) All exterior lighting fixtures will be designed, directed or shaded so that no direct light is cast upon any other property; and all driveways and off street parking areas will be designed and screened to minimize the illumination of adjacent properties by automobile headlamps;**

There are no exterior lighting fixtures being proposed.

- **Standard (12) All buildings and structures located within twenty-five (25') feet of the minimum front yard, side yard or rear yard required under Section 63.1 or Section 73.1 will be screened by landscaping of a type, nature and seasonal character that will ensure the privacy of adjacent dwellings and will ensure that the visual character of the use will be compatible with surrounding uses; and all accessory outdoor storage areas, mechanical equipment and waste disposal facilities will be screened from view of adjacent dwellings.**

The proposed scalloped landscaped berm will be installed to provide adequate screening of the proposed golf instruction building and driving range area. The berm will be constructed 5'-8' high and landscaped in order to meet the requirements of Standard (12).

The Village Engineer has reviewed the plans and has the following comments that should be addressed prior to Staff issuing a site clearance release permit:

#### **Preliminary Site Development**

1. Include arrows on the proposed to show all directions of flow in the major system to drain the entire site and surrounding area.
2. Submit drainage map of watershed basin affected.

### **Detailed Construction**

1. Provide all required storm water calculations.

### **General Drawings Comments**

1. Show any existing storm and arrows which denote general directions of flow.
2. Submit a copy of the SWP3 plan and NOI Storm Water General Permit application.
3. On the SWP3 plan, include a gravel "Construction Entrance".
4. On sheet C5, in the Sloped Headwall Detail, the notes section is missing words on item 1.

Mr. West summarizes his report by stating that Staff has properly notified the adjacent property owners and did not receive any comments.

The Planning Commission shall review the request and determine whether the applicant meets the "12 Standards for Special Exception". Should the Commission choose to approve the request, it shall be based on the following condition: "the applicant shall meet all storm water requirements per the Village Engineer."

After brief discussion, Mrs. Stolper made a motion to approve the special exception request with the following conditions:

1. The applicant must meet all storm water requirements as outlined in the Staff report by the Village Engineer.
2. The building must be designed and constructed to match the character and materials of the Camargo Club.
3. Staff shall review the height and slope of the berm during construction to make sure it meets typical construction and maintenance standards.

Mr. Wiggers seconded, and the motion was approved by a unanimous voice vote of the members in attendance.

**Item Number 3:** Case #17-003: Cincinnati Country Day School is requesting special exception approval for the replacement of a temporary/seasonal soccer field scoreboard with a permanent scoreboard in the same location. Cincinnati Country Day School operates under the continuing jurisdiction of the Planning Commission as an approved special exception. The property is located at 6905 Given Road.

Mr. Chris Woodside, Director of Development for Cincinnati Country Day School, comes before the Commission and states that they would like to replace the current temporary scoreboard with a much nicer permanent scoreboard in the same location.

Mr. Woodside adds that there is currently no lighting for the temporary scoreboard, and there will not be any added for the proposed permanent scoreboard.

**Staff Report:** Mr. West states that Cincinnati Country Day School operates under the continuing jurisdiction of the Planning Commission as an approved special exception. **Section 101.48** of the Indian Hill Zoning Ordinance requires that the Commission review and approve all applications for site clearance before issuance.

Mr. West notes that the twelve conditions for special exception approval and Staff's comments are contained in the Staff report; however, he highlights the following:

- **Standard (3) The special exception, either alone or in conjunction with other special exceptions previously granted or otherwise existing, will not injure, diminish, or impede the use, enjoyment, or normal and orderly development of other property in the immediate vicinity for uses permitted in the zoning district;**

Granting the request is consistent with other uses on the property as well as other special exceptions previously granted for Cincinnati Country Day School and Indian Hill Schools. The special exception request will not injure, diminish, or impede the orderly development of other properties in the vicinity and will have no negative impact on adjacent properties with the addition of landscape screening.

- **Standard (4) The special exception is consistent with the residential character of the immediate vicinity of the parcel proposed for development;**

The special exception is consistent with the use of the property as an approved special exception for a school. Additional landscape screening should be provided to screen from Given Road and adjacent properties.

- **Standard (11) All exterior lighting fixtures will be designed, directed or shaded so that no direct light is cast upon any other property; and all driveways and off street parking areas will be designed and screened to minimize the illumination of adjacent properties by automobile headlamps;**

Cincinnati Country Day School does not have lights on the soccer field; therefore the use of the scoreboard will only occur during daylight hours and is angled away from the existing residences.

The Planning Commission shall review the request and determine whether the applicant meets the "12 Standards for Special Exception". Should the Commission choose to approve the request, it shall be based on the following condition:

1. The applicant shall install evergreen trees and/or shrubs to help screen the scoreboard from Given Road, subject to Staff review/approval.

Mr. West notes that the applicant has plans for a “street tree planting project” due to losing a lot of large trees in the area.

Mr. Woodside comments that they are planning for a substantial spring planting which should coincide with the installation of the scoreboard.

Mr. West points out that the proposed sponsor panels on the scoreboard will not be corporate logos, but a sponsoring student’s name and the year they graduated.

After further discussion, Mr. Wiggers made a motion to approve the special exception request with the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall install evergreen trees and/or shrubs to help screen the scoreboard from Given Road, subject to Staff review/approval.
2. No corporate logos are permitted on the scoreboard.
3. The sponsor panels shall only be student families that helped pay for the scoreboard.

Mrs. Stolper seconded, and the motion was approved by a unanimous voice vote of those in attendance.

There being no further business to come before the Commission, Mr. Wiggers made a motion to adjourn. Mrs. Stolper seconded, and the motion was approved by a unanimous voice vote.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Paul F. Madden, Chairman

ATTEST:

---

Jonathan D. West, Secretary Pro-tem